Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030 RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

Appellate Case Information	Dept/Composition
Case Filed: 10-Jan-2024	2 opti composition
Case Filed. 10-ban-2024	
Case Closed:	

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

Side 1. RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT, Other

(Litigant Group) PETITIONER: SCHARF-NORTON CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL LITIGATION AT THE GOLDWATER INSTITUTE

Scharf-Norton Center for Constitutional Litigation, Petitioner

Attorneys for: Petitioner

Jonathan Matthew Riches, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 25712)

Timothy Sandefur, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 33670)

Scott Day Freeman, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 19784)

Stacy Skankey, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 35589)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: STEVEN SIMON LAW

Steven Simon Law, Commentor

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: JAMES C. MITCHELL

 James C Mitchell, Commentor AZ Bar No. 17387 [Resigned in Good Standing] SOLE PRACTIONER Admitted 10/19/96

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: ARIZONA BLACK BAR

• Arizona Black Bar, Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Pearlette J Ramos, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 28368)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: MICHAEL KIELSKY

 Michael Kielsky, Commentor AZ Bar No. 21864 [Current Member] Admitted 9/20/06

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: ADITYA DYNAR

 Aditya Dynar, Commentor AZ Bar No. 31583 [Current Member] Admitted 10/27/14

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: DUSTIN ROMNEY

 Dustin D Romney, Commentor AZ Bar No. 34728 [Current Member] Admitted 10/25/18

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: ARIZONA FOUNDATION FOR LEGAL SERVICE AND EDUCATION

- Arizona Foundation for Legal Services and Education, Commentor
- Kevin Ruegg, Arizona Foundation for Legal Services and Education, Commentor

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: MAURICIO R. HERNANDEZ

 Mauricio Hernandez, Commentor AZ Bar No. 020181

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: DR. RICHARD W. MORRIS, J.D., PH.D

 Richard W Morris, Ph.D., Commentor AZ Bar No. 2009 [Retired] Admitted 4/7/67

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: CHARLES F. HAUFF, JR.

 Mr Charles F Hauff, Jr, Commentor AZ Bar No. 14465 [Current Member] Admitted 10/24/92

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: DON BIVENS, et al.

- Don Bivens, Commentor AZ Bar No. 05134 [Current Member] Admitted 11/1/77
- Frederick M "Fritz" Aspey, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3018 [Current Member] Admitted 9/23/72
- Roxana C Bacon, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3758 [Resigned in Good Standing] Admitted 10/5/74
- Mr Alan P Bayham, Jr, Commentor AZ Bar No. 4817 [Current Member] SOLE PRACTIONER Admitted 4/30/77
- Bryan B Chambers, Commentor AZ Bar No. 14371 [Current Member] Admitted 10/24/92
- Amelia C Cramer, Commentor AZ Bar No. 18297 [Current Member] Admitted 10/18/97
- Whitney Cunningham, Commentor AZ Bar No. 15016 [Current Member] Admitted 10/23/93
- Stanley G Feldman, Commentor AZ Bar No. 838 [Current Member] Admitted 10/13/56
- Denis M Fitzgibbons, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12708 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/89
- Hon Brian Y Furuya, Commentor AZ Bar No. 25486
- Helen Perry Grimwood, Commentor AZ Bar No. 6355 [Current Member] Admitted 10/4/80
- Raymond A Hanna, Commentor AZ Bar No. 14182 [Current Member] Admitted 5/23/92
- Lisa S K Loo, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12246 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/88
- Michael R Murphy, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3201 [Current Member] Admitted 9/23/72
- Edward F Novak, Commentor AZ Bar No. 6092 [Current Member] Admitted 12/20/79

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

- Michael L Piccarreta, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3962 [Current Member] Admitted 10/5/74
- Richard T Platt, Commentor AZ Bar No. 9542 [Current Member] Admitted 5/12/84
- Jennifer R Rebholz, Commentor AZ Bar No. 24098 [Current Member]
- Dee-Dee Samet, Commentor AZ Bar No. 1631 [Current Member] Admitted 4/25/64
- Jessica S Sanchez, Commentor AZ Bar No. 24982 [Current Member] Admitted 1/11/07
- Robert E Schmitt, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3585 [Current Member] Admitted 9/29/73
- Kenneth J Sherk, Commentor AZ Bar No. 1371 [Current Member] Admitted 4/2/62
- Tom Slutes, Commentor AZ Bar No. 1212 [Current Member] Admitted 10/29/60
- Jimmie D Smith, Commentor AZ Bar No. 2661 [Current Member] SOLE PRACTIONER Admitted 9/26/70
- Geoffrey M Trachtenberg, Commentor AZ Bar No. 19338
- Pamela A Treadwell-Rubin, Commentor AZ Bar No. 10496 [Current Member] Admitted 11/9/85
- Alex B Vakula, Commentor AZ Bar No. 11749 [Current Member] Admitted 10/24/87
- Jeffrey Willis, Commentor AZ Bar No. 4870 [Current Member] Admitted 4/30/77
- Charles W Wirken, Commentor AZ Bar No. 4276 [Current Member] Admitted 10/11/75
- Robert B Van Wyck, Commentor AZ Bar No. 7800 [Current Member] Admitted 7/19/83

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

 Thomas A Zlaket, Commentor AZ Bar No. 1819 [Current Member] Admitted 9/25/65

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: ARIZONA COMMISSION ON ACCESS TO JUSTICE

- Arizona Commission on Access to Justice, Commentor
- Hon Samuel A Thumma, Arizona Commission on Access to Justice, Commentor

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: JAMES P. O'SULLIVAN

 Mr James P O'Sullivan, Commentor AZ Bar No. 9236 [Current Member] Admitted 10/15/83

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: LOS ABOGADOS HISPANIC BAR ASSOCIATION ("LOS ABOGADOS")

Los Abogados Hispanic Bar Association, Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Freddy A Saavedra, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 30848)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTORS: ARIZONA ASIAN AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION, ARIZONA BLACK BAR, AZ-LGBT BAR ASSOCIATION, ARIZONA MINORITY BAR ASSOCIATION, ARIZONA WOMEN LAWYERS ASSOCIATION, IRANIAN AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION, LOS ABOGADOS HISPANIC BAR ASSOCIATION AND NATIVE AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION OF ARIZONA

Arizona Asian American Bar Association, Commentor

Arizona Black Bar, Commentor

AZ-LGBT Bar Association, Commentor

Arizona Minority Bar Association, Commentor

Arizona Women Lawyers Association, Commentor

Iranian American Bar Association, Phoenix Chapter, Commentor

Los Abogados Hispanic Bar Association, Commentor

Native American Bar Association of Arizona, Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Christopher K Heo, Esq. (AZ Bar No. christopherheo)

Pearlette J Ramos, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 28368)

Randal Boyd McDonald, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 32008)

Alonzo Corral, Esq. (AZ Bar No. alonzocorral)

Anya Stangl, Esq. (AZ Bar No. anyastangl)

Saman John Golestan, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 31710)

Freddy A Saavedra, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 30848)

Kevin S Pooley, Esq. (AZ Bar No. kevinpooley)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: WILLIAM E. MORRIS INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE, COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES, DNA PEOPLE'S LEGAL SERVICES, AND SOUTHERN ARIZONA LEGAL AID

William E Morris Institute for Justice. Commentor

Community Legal Services, Commentor

DNA People's Legal Services Inc, Commentor

Southern Arizona Legal Aid, Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Andrew P Schaffer, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 37352)

Brenda Munoz Furnish, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27280)

Michelle J Simpson, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 20199)

Pamela M Bridge, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 18252)

Charles W Doughty, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27403)

Alan R Solot, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 6587)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: STATE BAR OF ARIZONA

State Bar of Arizona, Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Lisa M Panahi, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 23421)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: COUNCIL ON PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES IN THE LEGAL PROFESSION

 Council on Persons with Disabilities in the Legal Profession, Commentor **Attorneys for: Commentor**

Corey Lovato, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 34202)

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: TED A. SCHMIDT, et al.

- Mr Ted A Schmidt, Commentor AZ Bar No. 5030 [Current Member] Admitted 10/8/77
- Hon Frances T Lynch, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12249 [Current Member] SOLE PRACTIONER Admitted 10/21/88
- David J Armstrong, Commentor AZ Bar No. 17111 [Current Member] Admitted 10/19/96
- Patrick J McGroder, III, Commentor AZ Bar No. 2598 [Current Member] Admitted 9/26/70
- Robert N Brier, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12642 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/89
- Sean K McElenney, Commentor AZ Bar No. 16987 [Current Member] Admitted 1/29/97
- Susanne Ingold, Commentor AZ Bar No. 19143
- Nicholas Boca, Commentor AZ Bar No. 30666 [Current Member]
- William P Ring, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12860 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/89
- Daniel G Dowd, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12115 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/88
- Jill J Chasson, Commentor AZ Bar No. 19424 [Current Member] Admitted 5/21/99
- Mr David P Lewis, Commentor AZ Bar No. 15877 [Current Member] SOLE PRACTIONER Admitted 10/22/94
- Christine Whalin, Commentor AZ Bar No. 24912
- Brian I Clymer, Commentor AZ Bar No. 5579 [Current Member] Admitted 10/7/78
- Timothy M Medcoff, Commentor AZ Bar No. 19204 [Current Member]
- Nicole M Goodwin, Commentor AZ Bar No. 24593 [Current Member]

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

- Jeremy Zangara, Commentor
- G James Goodnow, III, Commentor AZ Bar No. 24695 [Current Member] Admitted 10/18/06
- Kevin E O'Malley, Commentor AZ Bar No. 6420 [Current Member] Admitted 10/4/80
- Mr Lawrence M Hecker, Jr, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3176 [Current Member] Admitted 9/23/72
- John G Sinodis, Commentor AZ Bar No. 11100 [Current Member] Admitted 10/25/86
- Sean J O'Hara, Commentor AZ Bar No. 24749 [Current Member] Admitted 10/18/06
- E Hardy Smith, Commentor AZ Bar No. 10463 [Current Member] Admitted 11/9/85
- Kenneth Van Winkle, Jr, Commentor AZ Bar No. 11752 [Current Member] Admitted 10/24/87
- Sam Daniels, Commentor
- Jonathan Rothschild, Commentor AZ Bar No. 7091 [Current Member] Admitted 10/17/81
- Scott W Rodgers, Commentor AZ Bar No. 13082 [Current Member] Admitted 5/19/90
- Scott I Palumbo, Commentor AZ Bar No. 21271
- Todd R Kerr, Commentor AZ Bar No. 13286 [Current Member] Admitted 10/27/90
- Mr Phillip P Guttilla, Commentor AZ Bar No. 16524 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/95
- Jason Wood, Commentor
- Brandon Rafi, Commentor
- Mr Leighton H Rockafellow, Commentor AZ Bar No. 3570 [Current Member] Admitted 9/29/73
- Jordan R Rose, Commentor

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

- Mark D Rubin, Commentor AZ Bar No. 7092 [Current Member] Admitted 10/17/81
- Russell B Stowers, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12903 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/89
- Bryan J Gottfredson, Commentor AZ Bar No. 25140 [Current Member]
- Barbara J Dawson, Commentor AZ Bar No. 12104 [Current Member] Admitted 10/21/88
- David E Funkhouser, III, Commentor AZ Bar No. 22449
- Lonnie J Williams, Jr, Commentor AZ Bar No. 5966 [Current Member] Admitted 10/13/79
- Benjamin P Taylor, II, Commentor AZ Bar No. 23868
- Ronald D Mercaldo, Commentor AZ Bar No. 2753 [Current Member] Admitted 4/3/71
- Ms Lynda C Shely, Commentor AZ Bar No. 15549 [Current Member] Admitted 5/21/94
- Mark S Bosco, Commentor AZ Bar No. 10167 [Current Member] Admitted 11/9/85
- Mr Stephen L West, Commentor AZ Bar No. 11764 [Current Member] Admitted 10/24/87
- Troy A Wallin, Commentor AZ Bar No. 23522
- Mr James A Whitehill, Commentor AZ Bar No. 11138 [Current Member] Admitted 11/3/86

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: COUNCIL ON MINORITIES AND WOMEN IN THE LAW

Council on Minorities and Women in the Law, Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Attorneys for: Commentor

Simon Goldenberg, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 34104)

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: LATINA MENTORING PROJECT

- Latina Mentoring Project, Commentor
- Jessica S Sanchez, Latina Mentoring Project, Commentor
- Hon Mina E Mendez, Latina Mentoring Project, Commentor
- Hon Ashley V Halvorson, Latina Mentoring Project, Commentor
- Julieta Carrillo, Latina Mentoring Project, Commentor
- Annelise M Dominguez, Latina Mentoring Project, Commentor

[181120]

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

(Litigant Group) COMMENTOR: ARIZONA LAWYERS FOR EQUAL JUSTICE STEERING COMMITTEE

- Arizona Lawyers for Equal Justice Steering Committee, Commentor
- Hon Carol Scott Berry, Arizona Lawyers for Equal Justice Steering Committee. Commentor
- Hon Roxanne K Song Ong, Arizona Lawyers for Equal Justice Steering Committee, Commentor
- Elena Nethers, Arizona Lawyers for Equal Justice Steering Committee, Commentor

consideration,

CASE STATUS

27 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

Aug 22, 2024....Continued

Jan 10, 2024..... Pending

		ZI FROGELDING ENTRIES
1.	10-Jan-2024	FILED: Petition to Amend Rules 32(b) and (c), Rules of the Supreme Court (Petitioners Scharf-Norton Center for Constitutional Litigation at the Goldwater Institute by Jonathan Riches, Timonthy Sandefur, Scott Day Freeman and Stacy Skankey)
2.	17-Jan-2024	Rule petitions have been filed in the above-captioned matters under Rule 28(a), Rules of the Supreme Court of Arizona. Upon

IT IS ORDERED that these petitions are opened for public comment pursuant to Rule 28(c), Rules of the Supreme Court of Arizona. Comments must be submitted by no later than Wednesday, May 1, 2024, and any reply by a petitioner must be submitted no later than Monday, June 3, 2024.

The petitions may be viewed by going to: http://www.azcourts.gov/Rules-Forum. This opens the "Welcome" page. Petitions are posted under the appropriate body of rules, for example, Rules of Criminal Procedure, which is found by scrolling down the page.

For instructions on how to post comments electronically, follow the steps listed above and click on http://www.azcourts.gov/rules/Forum-FAQ at the top of the "Forum FAQ" page and then "How do I file a comment on a Rule 28 petition?"

Alternatively, commenters may submit comments by filing an original and one paper copy of the comment and one electronic copy of the written comments and supporting documents in Microsoft Word format on a CD or other compatible electronic medium with the Clerk of the Supreme Court, 1501 West Washington St., Room 402, Phoenix, AZ 85007 in an envelope marked "Rule Comment."

Any person filing a comment must send a copy of the comment to the Petitioner electronically or by ordinary mail. (Hon. John R. Lopez IV)

3.	20-Jan-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Steven Simon Law)
4.	8-Feb-2024	FILED: (Comment) (James C. Mitchell)
5.	28-Mar-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Arizona Black Bar by Pearlette J. Ramos, President)
6.	1-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Michael Kielsky)
7.	1-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Aditya Dynar)
8.	3-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Dustin Romney)
9.	5-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Arizona Bar Foundation)
10.	25-Apr-2024	FILED: Comment in Support of Pending Petition (Mauricio R. Hernandez)
11.	26-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Dr. Richard W. Morris, J.D., Ph.D)
12.	28-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Charles F. Hauff, Jr.)
13.	29-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Don Bivens)
14.	29-Apr-2024	FILED: Comments of the Arizona Commission on Access to Justice Opposing the Petition (Arizona Commission on Access to Justice by Samuel A. Thumma, Chair)
15.	30-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (James P. O'Sullivan)

16.

30-Apr-2024 FILED: (Comment) (Los Abogados Hispanic Bar Association ("Los Abogados) by Freddy Saavedra, President)

Rule 28 Petition

R-24-0030

RULES 32(b) AND (c), RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT

	27 PROCEEDING ENTRIES				
17.	30-Apr-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Arizona Asian American Bar Association by Chirstopher Heo, President; Arizona Black Bar by Dr. Pearlette J. Ramos, President; AZ- LGBT Bar Association by Randy McDonald, President; Arizona Minority Bar Association by Alonzo Corral, President; Arizona Women Lawyers Association by Anya Stangl, President; Iranian American Bar Association Phoenix by Saman Golestan, President; Los Abogados Bar Association, Freddy Saavedra, President; Native American Bar Association of Arizona by Kevin Pooley, President)			
18.	30-Apr-2024	FILED: Comment on the Petition to Amend Rules 32(b) and (c), Rules of the Supreme Court (William E. Morris Institute for Justice by Andrew P. Schaffer, Brenda Munoz Furnish, and Michelle J. Simpson; Community Legal Services by Pamela Bridge; DNA People's Legal Services by Charles W. Doughty; Southern Arizona Legal Aid by Alan R. Solot)			
19.	30-Apr-2024	FILED: State Bar of Arizona Comment (State Bar of Arizona by Lisa M. Panahi, General Counsel)			
20.	1-May-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Council on Persons with Disabilities in the Legal Profession by Corey Lovato, Chair)			
21.	1-May-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Ted A. Schmidt)			
22.	1-May-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Council on Minorities and Women in the Law by Simon Goldenberg, Chair)			
23.	1-May-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Latina Mentoring Project by Hon. Minda Mendez, Jessica Sanchez, Hon. Ashley Villaverde Halvorson, Julieta Carrillo, Annelise M. Dominguez, Project Co-Chairs)			
24.	1-May-2024	FILED: (Comment) (Arizona Lawyers for Equal Justice Steering Committee by Ret. Hon. Carol Scott Berry, Ret. Roxanne Song Ong and Elena Nethers)			
25.	3-Jun-2024	FILED: Reply in Support of Petition to Amend Rules 32(b) and (c), Rules of the Supreme Court (Scharf-Norton Center for Constitutional Litigation at the Goldwater Institute by Jonathan Riches, Timothy Sandefur, Scott Day Freeman and Stacy Skankey)			
26.	20-Aug-2024	WOULD AMEND RULES 32(b) AND (c) OF THE RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT OF ARIZONA TO WOULD AMEND RULES 32(b) AND (c) OF THE RULES OF THE SUPREME COURT OF ARIZONA TO ELIMINATE THE AUTHORITY TO LEVY STATE BAR MEMBERSHIP DUES FOR NON-REGULATORY FUNCTIONS ORDERED: Petition to Amend Rules 32(b) and (c), Rules of the Supreme Court = CONTINUED until the December 2024 Rules Agenda. FURTHER ORDERED: The proposed amendments as revised are opened for public comment, with all comments due no later than October 1, 2024 and any reply due no later than October 15, 2024.			
27.	22-Aug-2024	In January 2024, this rule petition was filed proposing to amend Rules 32(b) and (c) of the Rules of the Supreme Court of Arizona. After considering the petition, the public comments submitted, and the reply during the August 2024 Rules Agenda, the Court deems it necessary to entertain an abbreviated period of public comment on the proposed amendments, as revised. The revisions are shown in the attachment to this order. After submission of public comments as provided below, this Court will consider at its December 2024 Rules Agenda whether to adopt the attached revisions. Therefore,			
		IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the revisions shown in the attachment to this order are opened for public comment under Rule 28(c), Rules of the Supreme Court of Arizona, with all comments due no later than October 1, 2024, and any reply due no later than October 15, 2024.			
		The revisions shown in the attachment may be viewed by going to: https://www.azcourts.gov/Rules-Forum. This opens the "Welcome" page. This order and attachment are posted under the file for this rule petition, which can be found by opening the category "Rules of the Supreme Court" and scrolling down the page.			
		For instructions on how to post comments electronically, click on https://www.azcourts.gov/rules/Forum-FAQ at the top of the "Forum FAQ" page and then "How do I file a comment on a Rule 28 petition?"			
		Alternatively, commenters may submit comments by filing an original and one paper copy of the comment and one electronic copy of the written comments and supporting documents in Microsoft Word format on a CD or other compatible electronic medium with the Clerk of the Supreme Court, 1501 West Washington St., Room 402, Phoenix, AZ 85007 in an envelope marked "Rule Comment."			
		Any person filing a comment must send a copy of the comment to the Petitioner electronically or by ordinary mail. (Hon. Ann A. Scott Timmer)			